

# **EXHIBIT 1**

**United States Court of Appeals  
For the First Circuit**

---

No. 10-1068

IN RE: WOLVERINE, PROCTOR & SCHWARTZ, LLC,

Debtor,

---

PETER A. CRAWFORD,

Plaintiff, Appellant,

v.

WOLVERINE PROCTOR & SCHWARTZ, INC., ET AL.,

Defendants, Appellees,

---

LYNNE F. RILEY, Chapter 7 Trustee of Wolverine, Proctor & Schwartz, LLC,

Trustee, Appellee.

---

No. 10-1334

IN RE: WOLVERINE PROCTOR & SCHWARTZ, LLC,

Debtor,

---

PETER A. CRAWFORD,

Appellant,

v.

LYNNE F. RILEY, Chapter 7 Trustee of Wolverine, Proctor & Schwartz, LLC; and  
THE PENSION BENEFIT GUARANTY CORPORATION,

Appellees.

No. 10-2230

---

PETER A. CRAWFORD,

Plaintiff, Appellant,

v.

WOLVERINE PROCTOR & SCHWARTZ, INC., ET AL.,

Defendants, Appellees.

---

Before

Lynch, Chief Judge,  
Torruella and Lipez, Circuit Judges.

---

**JUDGMENT**

Entered: April 20, 2011

Peter A. Crawford, a former Chief Operating Officer of Wolverine, Proctor & Schwartz, Inc. ("Wolverine"), a precursor of the Debtor in No. 10-1334, appeals a long list of bankruptcy and district court rulings, including (without limitation) the approval of the settlement agreement between the Bankruptcy Trustee and the Pension Benefit Guaranty Corporation; the jury verdict rejecting his claim to a bonus under his Employment Agreement, which he believes was tainted by trial error; the submission of the bonus issues to the jury and the denial of his post-trial motion for judgment as a matter of law; and summary judgment against his various other claims.

In No. 10-1334, we find no error in the approval of the bankruptcy settlement. The objections raised by appellant are debatable to doubtful and not so promising as to make the settlement unreasonable. As for the use of estimates, the parties did not have to use exact numbers to settle a benefit liabilities claim that is by nature probabilistic.

In Nos. 10-1068 and 10-2230, after careful consideration of appellant's arguments and the record, we are satisfied that the jury verdict was reasonable; that any trial error did not prejudice appellant; and that his remaining claims were subject to summary judgment.

Affirmed.

By the Court:

/s/ Margaret Carter, Clerk.

cc:

Michael L. Altman  
Janet E. Bostwick  
Steven F. Chilinski  
Peter A. Crawford  
John P. Dennis  
Ronald J. Friedman  
John P. Fitzgerald  
Jennifer H. Lagerquist  
Jennifer Bombard McGovern  
Lynne F. Riley  
Brad Q. Rogers  
Mark C. Rossi  
Joel W. Ruderman  
Annapoorni Rohini Sankaran  
Sara J. VanDeCarr  
Mark M. Whitney